

LUNDY MARINE PROTECTED AREA ADVISORY GROUP

The Aims of the Group are: 1) to provide a nucleus of expertise on the marine habitats and waters surrounding Lundy; 2) to provide a forum for exchanging views on present and proposed activities around Lundy; 3) to safeguard the interests of all those who use the waters around Lundy and its natural resources; and 4) to advise the Management Forum for the island.

Established: 1985



Please reply to the Hon. Secretary:

Mr Robert Irving
53 Northmoor Road
Dulverton
Somerset TA22 9PW

Tel. 01398 323047
Mob. 07713 114006
e-mail: Robert@sea-scope.co.uk

Notes of the 11th meeting of the Lundy Marine Protected Area Advisory Group

(formerly known as the Lundy Marine Conservation Zone Advisory Group, the Lundy Marine Nature Reserve Advisory Group, and originally the Lundy Marine Consultation Group, of which this was the 68th meeting)

held on **Tuesday 22nd October 2019** at 7.00 pm at the Ilfracombe SAC Clubhouse,
Ropery Road, Ilfracombe EX34 9EF.

Present:

Keith Hiscock	(KH)	Marine Biological Association – Chair
Robert Irving	(RI)	Lundy Field Society – Hon. Sec.
Derek Green	(DG)	Lundy General Manager
Andrew Bell	(ABel)	N Devon UNESCO Biosphere Reserve
Maggs Ashton	(MA)	Ilfracombe BSAC
Amanda Gartshore	(AG)	Ilfracombe BSAC
Andrew Benguey	(ABen)	Lundy Diving
Hefin Meara	(HM)	Historic England
Annette Dutton	(AD)	MARINELife/Coastwise
Geoff Huelin	(GH)	former fisherman
Dave Jenkins	(DJ)	Morte Wildlife Group
Lauren Parkhouse	(LP)	Devon & Severn IFCA
Rosie Ellis	(RE)	Lundy Assistant Warden
Phil Newman	(PN)	Warden, Skomer MCZ (guest speaker)

The Chairman (KH) welcomed all to the meeting, especially the new attendees and thanked Ilfracombe and North Devon Sub-Aqua Club for hosting the meeting. The purpose of the Group, he explained, was to allow the users of the Lundy MPA to “have their say” and to raise any particular issues they would like to see addressed. Any concerns or matters of importance can then be conveyed to the Lundy Management Forum at their next meeting (usually the following day) by the Group’s Hon. Sec.

1. *Apologies for absence*

Apologies had been received from: Dean Jones (Lundy Warden); Mel Parker (Natural England); Fiona Moffatt (Ilfracombe Yacht Club); Mike Deaton (Appledore SAC); Rick Morris (MARINELife); Clive Pearson (Charter boat *Jessica Hettie*); Rob Durrant (Ilfracombe BSAC/Coastwise); Chrissie Ingle (N. Devon Marine Pioneer Project); Dr Jenny Oates/Sarah Young (WWF UK-SEAS project); Ben Benguey (charter skipper & fisherman).

2. Notes on the last meeting of the MPA Advisory Group, held on 7th May 2019
(on board the MS *Oldenburg* alongside Bideford Quay)

- 2.1 Copies of these notes had been circulated by the Hon. Sec. prior to the meeting. No amendments were raised by those present, so the notes were agreed by all present as being an accurate record of the meeting.

3. Matters arising from the last meeting of the MPA Advisory Group (7th May 2019)

- 3.1 (3.2) Updating the **Zoning Scheme**. Quite a few months ago now, KH submitted a manuscript for a chapter, *"Using science effectively: selection, design and management of Marine Protected Areas"*, for a forthcoming book about Marine Protected Areas. The book is due out imminently. KH makes mention of the Lundy Marine Management Plan in the chapter. Unfortunately, the publishers have been unable to reproduce colour illustrations, so the figure of the Lundy MPA Zoning Scheme has had to be in black and white. This meant he has had to use an old version of the Zoning Scheme (dating from 2012), as there was currently not an up-to-date black and white (nor even colour one!) available. However, he did comment that the greyscale one from 2012 works well because it includes small circles of text identifying each zone separately.

A little later on during the meeting (but included here for convenience), RI explained how progress on the updated Zoning Scheme was going. Since the last meeting, various map files had been assimilated into a draft map by Tom Mullier of Plymouth University and an initial complete map had now been drawn up by the designer. The specific instruction had been to make sure the map was simple to understand visually, yet accurate as well.

RI held up a paper copy of what had been produced as a first draft and talked through it. There were a few ways to improve it, he thought. These were: (1) to refer to the reserve as an MPA and not an MCZ in the title; (2) the Map needs to be accompanied by a set of Notes which will explain what is where and why; (3) the colour scheme used needs to be bolder (& better distinguish the Recreational Zone from the Scallop Open Area); and is the best font being used?; (4) include the 100m No Anchoring/No Shot Lines zone around the Knoll Pins; (5) include recommended anchorages at The Rattles, Jenny's Cove and to the north of the Landing Bay; (6) include visitor mooring buoys at Gannets' Bay, Brazen Ward and in the Landing Bay; (7) that a black & white version should also be produced suitable to include in scientific publications; and (8) consider printing the Zoning Scheme map on one side of a single A4 sheet (folded into a 3-column leaflet) and the Code of Conduct on the reverse. KH also added that the version of the Scheme being updated had small circles of text on the map (as well as distinct colours), which left no doubt as to the interpretation of each zone.

The final point raised by RI was that the outer boundaries for the Lundy MCZ and the original boundary for the MNR do not quite align themselves. He found this puzzling. LP agreed and added that the IFCA had queried this with GIS people at Natural England, but without finding out why this was the case. KH queried why this should matter - surely the Lat./Long. positions of the four corners for each designation were the same? One other point was made by ABeI who commented that the colours used were confusing for a colour blind person, reinforcing the need for a copy of the map to be in greyscale and/or with each zone labelled.

It was agreed that these suggested alterations were put to the designer for a second draft to be produced. A copy of the first draft is included with these Notes.

4. Relevant matters from the last Lundy Management Forum meeting held on 8th May 2019

For the first time, the minutes of the last Lundy Management Forum meeting (held on 8th May 2019) had been circulated to members of the Advisory Group, following an agreement for 'mutual openness' between the two bodies, as requested at the last Advisory Group meeting. There was therefore no need for DG to go through the minutes of the last meeting of the Forum, as has happened in the past. However, he welcomed any questions being asked. Instead, he was able to concentrate on recent management matters that had affected the island.

- 4.1 KH asked if the collapsed scaffolding poles at Brazen Ward were still there. DG confirmed that they were - some had been removed but most were still submerged. He was aware that they required extracting but it was a matter of finding the right time, weather conditions and availability of the *Oldenburg* to be able to do this.
- 4.2 The Landmark Trust's 50th anniversary celebrations had taken place on the island over the weekend of 28/29 September. [Lundy had been bought by the National Trust (thanks to a very generous donation by the late Jack Hayward) in 1969, and immediately leased to the Landmark Trust who had agreed to upgrade, maintain and manage the island for the next 60 years]. Unfortunately, strong winds had led to the sailing of the *Oldenburg* on the 29th being cancelled (with over 250 invited guests on board). However, a scaled-down event did take place, with dignitaries (Chairman & Director of the Landmark Trust; Regional Director & Regional Manager of the National Trust; and Lord David Owen, who as a local N. Devon MP had been active in supporting the island's purchase by the National Trust in 1969) flying in by helicopter at 10:30am once the fog had lifted! A church service was held in St Helen's Church, followed by some speeches, some food and a few drinks in the Tavern later on. DG also wanted to add his thanks to all members of the Advisory Group for their help in various ways over the past 50 years. A new lease for the next 50 years has recently been signed between the National Trust and the Landmark Trust, which will allow for the forward planning of a number of infrastructure projects involving water, power and transport for the island.
- 4.3 KH asked if DG knew if someone from Natural England was going to be attending the Management Forum meeting tomorrow. DG confirmed that Rob Large would be there. KH reminded everyone present that it was also 50 years ago this September that the suggestion of establishing a voluntary marine reserve around the island had been put to John Smith, Founder and Chairman of the Landmark Trust.
- 4.4 DG added that communications to/from the island had just taken a welcome leap forward with a transfer from a satellite link to 4G. He hoped that this might help to get the outputs from the automatic Weather Station on-line, which had been proving difficult.

5. Conservation Team Report (April – October 2019)

- 5.1 In Dean Jones' absence, this report was presented by the island's Assistant Warden/Education Officer Rosie Ellis. A pdf copy of the full report had been circulated to all members of the Advisory Group before the meeting. Rosie took up her post in August following the departure of Siân Cann at the end of July.
- 5.2 ABel raised the point that seal disturbance had been reported on two occasions: once by some jet skiers and a second incident by a charter boat. ABen pointed out that there were some new charter boats operating around Lundy now and that their skippers were not accredited under the Lundy Charter Boats Accreditation Scheme. He suggested that a course be run before next summer to inform new skippers of expected conduct within the MPA and to refresh the knowledge of existing members of the Scheme. ABen believed the course hadn't been run for at least five years [RI has checked this: the Scheme, a joint initiative between N Devon Biosphere Reserve & Lundy, was initiated at the end of 2015, with "the next course due to take place in January 2016" - LMPAAdGp notes, Oct. 2015]. ABel added

that skippers had also been promised a 'sightings network' for reporting wildlife sightings and this had yet to be delivered. DG agreed it would be sensible to look at running another course.

- 5.3 The Warden's Report mentioned the number of seal pups recorded this year so far (38) was considerably higher than in 2018 (27) and in 2017 (25). However, there had also been more pup deaths. It was suggested that the high number of dead pups might be because of bad weather and high spring tides at the end of September separating mothers from pups and displacing animals from the west coast to the east coast. ABen pointed out that over 20 years of visiting Lundy, he had never seen so many seal pup corpses. He suggested an alternative hypothesis: paddle-boarders falling off their boards had inadvertently disturbed hauled-out seals from time to time. He wondered if the disturbance to possibly pregnant females had led to still births, and it was these dead pups that were being seen. Phil Newman, Skomer MCZ Warden, commented that they too had seen an increase in both seal productivity and pup deaths this year, so it seems unlikely to be a Lundy-centric event.
- 5.4 The behaviour of paddle-boarders was discussed further and it was thought sensible for the Code of Conduct to be looked at again to ensure this activity was included. DG agreed to discuss this with the Warden. By comparison, ABen added that kayakers seemed to behave responsibly and not cause basking seals to be disturbed. RI agreed to raise these matters at tomorrow's Management Forum.
- 5.5 KH complimented the Conservation Team for producing such a well presented report. He also added that he was disappointed that the Facebook page, which had been instigated to record unusual marine wildlife sightings, had not been used as frequently as he had hoped would be the case. He pointed out that common octopus *Octopus vulgaris* (two rows of suckers on their arms as opposed to the curled octopus *Eledone cirrhosa* with just one) were being seen more frequently in the English Channel this year and wondered if they had shown up at Lundy yet. (DG said that a common octopus had been washed up recently on Westward Ho! beach, a record which KH had been told about).
- 5.6 RI pointed out that he was pleased to see the Lundy website had been updated, or at least was in the process of being updated (at last!). However, on the marine pages, he had still come across a photo taken in the Mediterranean of a sea fan, although the whale shark thankfully had now disappeared. DG explained that it was very much 'a work in progress' with a lot of content still to be uploaded.

6. Natural England update

- 6.1 Mel Parker was not present at the meeting but had sent RI some comments. She explained that she had little to report to the Group. She welcomed that plans for a marine bioblitz next year, towards which Natural England had provided £4.5k funding, were beginning to take shape. She requested that KH update the Group on the current review of Highly Protected Marine Areas (HPMAs) - see below. MP also mentioned the Marine Management Plan, how she would like to see the Warden referring to it more, and how aspects of it were being delivered (or not so) through the Warden's work programme. "It would be good to know if there were key areas of the Plan that were not being addressed and whether there is any appetite to address them. It should also be used when new proposals come in as to whether or not they meet the agreed objectives set out in the Plan."
- 6.2 KH explained that the Lundy MPA contained an HPMA in the form of the No Take Zone off the island's east coast. Defra are currently undertaking a review of HPMAs (led by Richard Benyon MP) to assess whether more of them should be established, how this might be done and what form they should take. Geographically, the waters covered by the review are restricted to English inshore and offshore areas and offshore areas off Northern Ireland (see <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/highly-protected-marine-areas-hpmas->

review-2019). The 6-month consultation period ends on 26th October. KH pointed out that the on-line form seeking opinions, which he has completed and submitted, is very long! LP added that Mat Mander and Sarah Clark have also submitted a response on behalf of Devon & Severn IFCA. The review is asking if consultees know of any areas they would recommend as being HPMA's. KH added that he felt there were two reasons to establish HPMA's: (1) as fish recovery areas (which would be quite large); & (2) having areas that were as close as possible to being in a natural state so that natural fluctuations in abundance and such traits as growth rates and longevity of species could be studied.

7. D&SIFCA update

- 7.1 LP pointed out she only had a few things to say. She was pleased that the IFCA now had an agreement in principle with the Environment Agency to use their RHIB based on N. Devon (which would be launched from Bideford) to carry out their law enforcement work. DG pointed out this suggestion of boat sharing was raised at the last Lundy Management Forum meeting, so he was pleased to see matters had progressed successfully. KH added that it would be really good to see an IFCA presence off the north coast from time to time. LP pointed out that the IFCA's method of working had been changing in recent years, with more co-operative working with other agencies (such as the Marine Management Organisation) and more remote surveillance (making use of the VMS/IVMS systems which all mobile gear fishing boats >7m long were now required to have). Instead of general patrolling duties, the IFCA officers now undertook a much more targeted response based on various intelligence inputs.
- 7.2 DG added that he didn't think there had been any cases of recent infringements reported from the island, a situation he suspected may be linked to the VMS/IVMS requirement.
- 7.3 Finally, LP wanted to mention crawfish/spiny lobsters. The number of reportings of these in south Devon had continued to increase, with some fishermen doing tagging work on behalf of the IFCA (20 crawfish had been tagged in the past 5-6 weeks). She's keen that this tagging is also undertaken by N. Devon potters, so she's waiting to hear from any happy to take part. KH added that he had recently written an article for *British Wildlife* magazine on the biology of the crawfish, which should be coming out in either December's issue or in February's. Just to remind folks, the spiny lobster or crawfish is the only designated feature of the Lundy Marine Conservation Zone.

8. Marine archaeological update

- 8.1 Hefin Meara was welcomed to the meeting. This was his first attendance and he thanked those present for inviting him. He had taken over from Alison James. He is the Marine Archaeologist for the Listing Projects and Marine Team within Historic England, based in Swindon.
- 8.2 Earlier in the summer a submission had been put to the Minister of the Department of Culture, Media and Sport recommending that the wreck of HMS *Montagu* at Lundy be protected as a Scheduled Monument. The adjacent Montagu Steps, which had been cut into the cliff soon after the grounding of the ship to allow access for salvors (and soon afterwards for tourists), were also submitted for protection as a Scheduled Monument. This submission followed an assessment of the wreck by Wessex Archaeology in April and July 2018.
- 8.3 At the end of September 2019, both HMS *Montagu* and Montagu Steps were designated as Scheduled Monuments. This means that, for the wreck in particular, the site will be protected from unlawful damage but access to it will not be restricted. The protected area around the wreck extends for a radius of 100m around the point 51.159 N 04.674 W. The wreck is owned by BCD Marine Ltd (the "salvor in possession"). A pdf of the schedule for HMS *Montagu* is being distributed

with these Notes. The scheduling means that no artefacts are allowed to be removed from the wreck.

- 8.4 [A "Scheduled Wreck" is slightly different from a "Protected Wreck" (which both the *Iona II* and the Gull Rock site are designated as being). The former is scheduled under the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 as it appears to be of national importance. The latter is designated under The Protection of Wrecks Act 1973 because of historical, archaeological or artistic value. A licence is required to dive on a Protected Wreck site; none is required for a Scheduled Wreck. There are in the region of 20,000 scheduled monuments in England, although HMS *Montagu* is believed to be the first subtidal wreck Scheduled Monument in England. There are about 50 Protected Wrecks in England and Wales.]
- 8.5 Regarding the two Protected Wrecks, HM explained that the list of licensed divers remains the same (see Notes from 7th May 2019). He added that he would be keen to hear from anyone who had any additional information about the *Montagu*, particularly photographs. DG pointed out that the "Lundy Collectors" [members of the Lundy Collectors Club] had a large number of original black and white photographs of the grounded ship and of the walkway to it from Montagu Steps.
- 8.6 [Since the meeting, the wreck of the *South Australian*, a clipper ship carrying a cargo of railway track when she sank in rough weather in 1889 just 3 miles off the NE of Lundy on the edge of the Stanley Bank, has also been designated a Scheduled Monument. A great deal of the marine archaeological study of this wreck had been conducted by members of the Ilfracombe SAC and Keith Denby in particular. The wreck lies at 42m depth though is outside the MPA.]

9. The North Devon Marine Pioneer project

- 9.1 ABel explained that his colleague Chrissie Ingle, Manager of the N. Devon Marine Pioneer Project, sent her apologies and that he would give a short report on the project in her absence. The Project officially ends in March 2020 so most efforts now are geared towards producing final reports and end products, although it is envisaged the project will continue beyond this date in some guise.
- 9.2 Most work has focussed on producing a Marine Natural Capital Plan, which will compliment the Terrestrial Natural Capital Plan produced by the sister Landscape Pioneer project, also centred on N. Devon. It is hoped the Marine Natural Capital Plan will fit into the SW Marine Plan (being drawn up by the MMO). The Plan contains an Assets and Risks Register, which was commissioned to be undertaken by Dr Siân Rees and colleagues at Plymouth University.
- 9.3 A number of short 5-minute films (collectively entitled "*Journey to the Sea*") have been produced as part of the project, linking the Landscape Pioneer with the Marine Pioneer by following the flow of water from a catchment area via a river to an estuary and coastal waters (and to an offshore island!). These films will be shown for their first viewing at Westward Ho! on 14th November [Since the meeting, this date has now been put back to mid-January]. The films will also be put up on the WWF website and the Biosphere's website.
- 9.4 The Biosphere Reserve has also been looking into fisheries management in N. Devon and have been discussing ideas with Defra. Ideas being discussed include Cod Limitation Orders; Effort-based Management Systems; Local Management; and Value-Added projects. These ideas will be developed and will run on beyond the end-date of the Marine Pioneer next year.
- 9.5 ABel explained that the Biosphere Reserve is also looking at its Blue Carbon resource, particularly the extent and quality of its saltmarshes, seagrass beds and kelp forests. These ecosystems have been shown to be important in sequestering carbon dioxide and as a result are being looked at as an important means of mitigating climate change effects.
- 9.6 ABel also wanted to mention briefly the InterReg tourism project for which he had

managed to secure funding. He had recently been on a fact-finding trip to the Iroise Natural Marine Park in Brittany, and was able to appreciate some of the management issues which were being dealt with there (many of which were similar to those he is having to deal with in N. Devon). The Marine Park covers a large area (3,550 km²/1,370 sq miles), has 30 staff and six boats, so considerably bigger than what we're used to!

Some of the InterReg project's funding would be directed towards specific tourism-enhancing projects on Lundy, and he had been speaking with DG about possibilities.

10. The WWF UK SEAS Project

- 10.1 In the absence of Sarah Young, ABel gave a brief update on the project. Sadly, funding for the project has been withdrawn by Sky Ocean Rescue, who have had "a change of strategic direction" and decided that they wish to focus more on mass consumer engagement, so this kind of local work doesn't fit into their strategy anymore. The one aspect to the project which is continuing for a little longer is the sustainable finance project (those present at the last meeting will recall a brief introduction to this project - how can MPAs become self-funding? - by Olivia Bennett and Alicia Gibson from Environmental Finance).
- 10.2 An earlier WWF-commissioned report by Eftec had concluded that it would cost about £150k/year to manage an MPA effectively. With five MPAs now present in N. Devon, this amounted to £750k/year that was needed to manage these MPAs. On a national basis, with 270 MPAs, this totalled £40.5 million. Environmental Finance have recommended setting up a 'Blue Bond' scheme to raise finance, and the plan is to launch next summer.

11. Any other business

- 11.1 No-one present had any other business they wished to bring to the attention of others.

Date of next meeting: Monday, 27th April 2020
at 7:00 pm on board the MS *Oldenburg* tied up alongside Bideford Quay.

12. The Lundy Marine Festival 2020

- 12.1 As reported at previous Advisory Group meetings, a marine bioblitz had been proposed to take place on the island during 2020. It will be necessary to allow such an event to take place over more than one spring tide period (for shore explores), in case bad weather led to the cancellation of a single spring tide period. Having divers wanting to make the use of neap tide periods (when currents are at their weakest), it soon became apparent that a bioblitz would have to be run over several weeks. With quite a few other citizen science marine projects which could be undertaken using volunteers being suggested, the bioblitz has now developed into a fully blown 'Festival' which will last for 3 months. The dates are to be from **Tuesday 23rd June until Sunday 20th September 2020**. RI has offered to act as Co-ordinator of the Festival.
- 12.2 Having put out a few 'feelers' to various organisations, RI has been very pleased with initial responses and with offers of support. Beyond the bioblitz itself, when both experts and non-experts will participate in searching for species on the island's various shores, there are many and varied projects which can be undertaken, involving marine invertebrates, seaweeds, fishes, seals, cetaceans and seabirds.

The bioblitz and various monitoring projects will also be carried out by groups of divers.

- 12.3 The intention will be to use both the Beach Building and the St Helen's Centre for interpretive purposes, with a field laboratory set up with sorting trays and microscopes, an aquarium, poster displays, exhibitions, and talks from the experts.
- 12.4 So far, the following organisations are planning to take part:
N Devon Coastwise; Lundy Field Society; Porcupine Marine Natural History Society; MARINELife; Morte Wildlife Group; Marine Conservation Society (Seasearch); Ilfracombe Dive Club; Appledore Dive Club; N Devon UNESCO Biosphere Reserve; and others...
- 12.5 The Festival will also act as an 'umbrella' for various other marine events which will be happening next summer, such as a MARINELife week-long training course being held on the island on the identification of cetaceans and seabirds; the Splash In! photo competition (which will last for the whole 3 months and will include an edited video section for the first time); and the 2-day Clovelly Pilot Gig Race, an annual event rowed between Clovelly and Lundy.
- 12.6 It is still early days in the planning of the event, but the level of interest is rising as more people get to hear of what's being planned. A small organising committee has been formed and will assist with decision-making and in arranging possible sponsorship of the event. Please let RI know if you can contribute in any way to the Festival, even if this might just be ideas.

13. **The Skomer Marine Conservation Zone**

A presentation by Phil Newman, Marine Warden, Skomer MCZ, Pembrokeshire

Phil gave a fascinating talk on the workings of the Skomer MCZ, where he has acted as Marine Warden for 28 years (although his official title is now Marine Environment Protection Officer). [I tend to think of Lundy and Skomer as being siblings, as they are a similar size, they each have nationally important seabird colonies, and they each started out their marine protection as voluntary marine nature reserves which then became statutory ones].

At Skomer, there are two conservation teams: one looks after the top of the island and the other (which Phil heads up) looks after the marine side (high water mark and below). The marine team have two full-time employees and two part-time, all employed by Natural Resources Wales. The marine reserve around the island also includes much of the adjacent Marloes Peninsula, where the team's office is based. They have two boats (a hardboat and a RHIB) available for their exclusive use. Most of their time revolves around monitoring - both of the biology, of environmental factors and of human activities too. There are close ties with a number of educational establishments and the team get involved with sampling for various bodies.

Similar to Lundy, Skomer has a wide variety of marine habitats within the marine reserve. It is a hotspot for sea slugs (there have been 79 species recorded - two thirds of the UK total) and there is also a very rich sponge fauna too (about 130 species). Phil showed photos of how they go about their various monitoring projects, and explained how the results of this monitoring work then influences the management of the site.

Phil and his team publish a number of well presented reports each year covering their marine monitoring work, all of which are available for all to see on-line:

<https://naturalresources.wales/evidence-and-data/research-and-reports/marine-reports/publications-and-research-related-to-marine-biotopes-and-species/?lang=en>